

DEFERRED APPLICATION**C SW2003/1416/RM - DEMOLITION OF REDUNDANT METHODIST CHAPEL AND ERECTION OF A DETACHED TWO STOREY DWELLING, OLD METHODIST CHAPEL, EATON BISHOP, HEREFORD, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR2 9QD****For: Mr A Clarke per Mr G Bacon, Brownings Acre, Whitehouse Lane, Alfrick, Worcester, WR6 5HE****Date Received: 12th May 2003 Ward: Stoney Street Grid Ref: 4440 3907****Expiry Date: 7th July 2003**

Local Member: Councillor D.C. Taylor

1. Site Description and Proposal

- 1.1 The application site is on the eastern side of the Class III road (C1199) that constitutes the main throughfare of Eaton Bishop.
- 1.2 This application was reported to Sub-Committee on 15th July, 2003, when Members resolved that it be deferred, as it was considered that the house was too large for the site and it should be moved, in particular, away from the northern boundary.
- 1.3 The site has a red brick chapel on it, with a slate roof. There is a red brick boundary wall approximately 1½ metres back from the metalled edge of the C1199 road. There is little room to park a vehicle off the road. The chapel is understood to have become vacant in 1974. It was originally on a much smaller plot. This was enlarged when the applicant owned the adjoining dwelling (Carpenters) and he realigned the common boundary between the Carpenters and the Chapel. There is a two-storey dwelling to the south known as Orchard House, which was the village shop. The boundary between the Orchard House is staggered, it was originally delineated as a straight line, it was then amended following representations being made by the owner.
- 1.4 This site has a rear boundary with agricultural land and has a western outlook across the above mentioned Class III road and towards the graveyard of St. Michaels and All Angels Church.
- 1.5 The proposed dwelling is a two-storey, 3 bedroom dwelling comprising red facing brick under a Redland Grovebury, Breckland Black colour, tiled roof. The main element is 6.75 metres to the ridge aligned north-east to south-west, which is parallel to the highway (C1199) from which it will gain access.
- 1.6 There is a single storey element on the eastern side, i.e. away from the highway, and on the roadside side elevation is a lower two-storey element providing the third bedroom and bathroom over part of the double garage that is at right angles to the road.
- 1.7 The main building, which is narrower in footprint than the existing Chapel, is approximately 8.7 metres back from the metalled edge of the highway, the garage and lower two-storey element bring the building as close as 1.65 metres from the metalled

DEFERRED APPLICATION

edge of the same highway, which is just behind the line of the existing red brick wall that runs for a distance of 9.4 metres across the front of this site.

- 1.8 The application has been revised from that presented to Sub-Committee in July. There are no longer any north or south facing windows at first floor level and above in the building. Also, the chimney in the living room has been removed, and the area on the northern gable re-sited further away from the boundary. The garage immediately adjoining the new building has been pulled 300mm away from the northern boundary shared with The Carpenters, also the building has been moved away from this boundary such that the narrowest points of the building are 900mm away from the boundary. The southern gable end of the dwelling has also been reduced by 350mm. This would leave the nearest point, the south-eastern corner being 1.25m away from the hedge and tree lined boundary shared with Orchard House.

2. Policies

2.1 Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan

Policy H.16A - Housing in Rural Areas

2.2 South Herefordshire District Local Plan

Policy GD.1 - General Development Criteria
Policy SH.8 - New Housing Development Criteria in Larger Villages
Policy SH.14 - Siting and Design of Buildings

3. Planning History

- 3.1 SH931024PF Alterations to existing church building to convert into one bedroom dwelling - Refused 22.09.93
- SW2001/1970/O Site for erection of 3 bedroomed cottage style dwelling - Approved 06.02.02

4. Consultation Summary

- 4.1 The Environment Agency states that it understands the applicant proposes to connect to an adjacent private sewerage system, this system should be capable of accepting the increase in flow and loading. Also the land should have adequate permeability for surface water soakaway in accordance with BS6297: 1983.

5. Representations

- 5.1 The Parish Council's observations are awaited.
- 5.2 Four letters of representation have been received from:

G. P. Allen, The Manor House, Eaton Bishop, HR2 9QD
Mr. & Mrs. A. Morris, The Carpenters, Eaton Bishop, HR2 9QD
A. P. & A. J. Haines, Orchard House, Eaton Bishop, HR2 9QD

The following main points are raised:

- cramped site
- does not fall within definition of cottage style dwelling

DEFERRED APPLICATION

- chapel of historic interest (1865) could be enlarged modestly, not destroyed
- Parish Council's previous recommendation as to re-use/modification of the Chapel have not been considered
- only 175mm from boundary and one metre from other property
- need 1.2 metre gap, what about future maintenance?
- no kink in boundary with The Carpenters
- windows on north and south elevations prohibited by conditions, will overlook house and garden, loss of privacy
- too close to road, narrow part of road difficult for 2 cars to pass
- our 1969 dwelling, had a 30 foot building line, this is closer, inconsistent and out of character
- chimney in living room, creates health and safety issue given slope of site, reduce height of it, suffer from bonfires now
- no indication of how effluent will be disposed, poor permeability of land, should go to Pulley Avenue
- bats in the Chapel, should be investigated
- surprised to see north wall of building moved further away
- had no objection to original siting as it added to our privacy
- no objection to gable end chimney, but concerned with rear flue now dispensed with
- if north facing bathroom window obscure glazed would withdraw objection.

The full text of these letters can be inspected at Southern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officers Appraisal

- 6.1 It is considered that the main issues relate to the loss of the Chapel, the form of the development, its relationship to adjacent boundaries, proximity to the road, and the means of foul drainage disposal.
- 6.2 The principle of erecting a dwelling on this site involving the loss of the Chapel has already been accepted at the outline stage. The need to provide a safe access and the ability to manoeuvre on site would entail the demolition of the Chapel.
- 6.3 The main building is well sited some 8.7 metres back from the metalled edge of the highway. Were the Chapel to be utilised in some way this would have brought the building closer to the highway. It is considered that the form of development does not detract from the character of the village, as further south older traditional buildings are even closer to the highway. Pushing the dwelling further into the site would possibly impact more on the property to the north of the site.
- 6.4 The dwelling has been revised such that it is further away from the boundary with The Carpenters. The nearest points are 900mm. This is notwithstanding that the residents of The Carpenters did not object to the original siting of the dwelling in relationship to their property. The applicant has also taken 350mm off the southern end of the main building, given the building has been re-positioned slightly southward. There is still a minimum gap of 1.25 metres. Members were concerned that the building was too cramped given the proximity of the dwelling, in particular to the northern boundary. It is considered that these concerns have been addressed by the revised plans submitted.

DEFERRED APPLICATION

- 6.5 The chimney on the single-storey element has also been removed, which overcomes the possibility of increasing its height given the requirements of the Building Regulations.
- 6.6 Details of the foul drainage disposal were submitted just prior to the Sub-Committee meeting. The method and route is supported by the Environment Agency, Welsh Water and the Council's Housing Manager.
- 6.7 There will be no overlooking windows on north or south facing elevations of The Carpenters nor Orchard House and therefore the issues raised previously in the report to Sub-Committee have been fully addressed.
- 6.8 The access arrangements are considered acceptable. The Head of Engineering and Transportation raises no objection.
- 6.9 It is considered that the revised proposal overcomes the issues raised previously by Sub-Committee. This is a site that does taper when viewed from the highway and therefore only a very narrow dwelling would leave sufficient space for a clear view down both sides. The footprint of the main building is 1.6 metres longer than that of the existing chapel and 0.3 metres narrower. The proposal it is considered complies with the provisions of Policies GD.1, SH.8 and SH.14 contained in the South Herefordshire District Local Plan.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

- 1. A01 (Time limit for commencement (full permission))**

Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

- 2. A07 (Development in accordance with approved plans)**

Reason: To ensure adherence to the approved plans in the interests of a satisfactory form of development.

- 3. The foul drainage shall be taken from the site to a private sewage plant in accordance with the details submitted, prior to first occupation of the dwelling.**

Reason: In order to define the terms to which the application relates

- 4. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no windows/dormer windows shall be constructed in the north and south elevations at the first floor level and above of the property.**

Reason: In order to protect the residential amenity of adjacent properties.

DEFERRED APPLICATION

Decision:

Notes:

.....

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.